

of Soviet development under communism, so assiduously cultivated by Moscow. At the same time, it has had the effect of placing relations between Soviet Russia and China under an additional, unnecessary strain. For better or for worse, Mao Tse-tung linked himself with Stalin, frequently invoking the latter's name and authority in his works. Thus, although it may have served Khrushchev's immediate political purposes to destroy the Stalin image, Mao obviously had no such interest. The Chinese were willing to go along with Moscow to the extent of deprecating what they euphemistically term Stalin's "errors," but they have understandably balked at his wholesale demolition.<sup>13</sup> The problem of Stalin's place in history must remain of more than casual interest for the Chinese even after the death of Mao Tse-tung, because through

<sup>13</sup> This feeling is best expressed in a 1956 Chinese Politburo statement cited by Brzezinski: "In our opinion Stalin's mistakes take second place to his achievements." Z. Brzezinski, *The Soviet Bloc*, New York, Praeger, 1961, p. 278. Cf. D. S. Zagoria, *The Sino-Soviet Conflict 1956-1961*, Princeton University Press, 1962, p. 48.

<sup>14</sup> *Stalin*, New York, Workers Library Publishers, 1940, p. 89. Thus wrote Khrushchev in commemoration of Stalin's 60th birthday on December 21, 1939.

Mao's identification with Stalin and Stalinist policies it bears on the legitimacy of the entire development of Chinese communism from the twenties to the sixties.

In sum, the balance sheet of Khrushchev's de-Stalinization policy is by no means wholly in the black. On the contrary, though it admittedly would require careful handling, at least a partial restoration of the Stalin image would appear to hold certain advantages for the Soviet leadership. Among other things, it would probably improve Moscow's relations with China, and many of the more militant Asian, African and Latin American parties.

At present Khrushchev can stifle internal criticism, but after he is gone from the scene, his successors may well want to dissociate themselves from his "errors" and the handicaps of his policy. In that event they may well hark back to Khrushchev's own words written in 1939: "The biography of Comrade Stalin is the glorious epic of our Bolshevik party."<sup>14</sup> Except for the adjective, it is hard to quarrel with him.

A. J. Groth

(Mr. Groth is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Davis.)

## Censorship in Russia: A Note

"AS WE LEAVE the confinement of serf censorship," Lenin wrote in 1905, "we do not want to, and will not, enter the prison of bourgeois-mercenary literary relationships. We want to create, and will create, a free press not only in the police sense but also in the sense that it is free from capital, free from careerism; and free, moreover, from bourgeois anarchical individualism." ("Party Organization and Party Literature," *Novaia zhizn*, No. 12, November 1905.)

The limitations of Lenin's definition of freedom of the press were brought home to the writer during a visit to the USSR last year, when he was able to examine briefly a curious volume entitled *Svodny spisok knig, podlezhashchikh isklucheniin iz bibliotek i knigotorgovoi seti, Chast II*. (Summary list of books subject to withdrawal from libraries and the trading network, Part II).

Many of the titles in the list were of obvious political significance or were listed under authors who have been in

disgrace. Titles of innocuous books, such as old school texts on non-political subjects or outdated technical literature, which must have numbered many thousands, were absent. (These are probably covered by separate, open lists, or are simply turned in for pulping at the discretion of booksellers, librarians, or local officials.) The "Summary List" thus is undoubtedly a political selection and, for this reason, was distributed confidentially. Each copy was numbered, indicating that distribution of the list was restricted to official organizations such as state libraries, cultural institutions, ministries which have their own training schemes, libraries, book distributors and, last but not least, secondhand book dealers. Part II was edited by a certain I. Shefer and passed for publication by the All-Union Book Chamber in Moscow on July 12, 1961; and the edition was fairly large, numbering something under 35,000 copies. Some details about the size and content of Part I were later made available to the writer by an extremely

reliable source. The publication as a whole is of considerable interest in that it sheds a gleam of light on something we know all too little about—the workings of the internal censorship system in the USSR.

PERHAPS THE MOST surprising thing about the "Summary List" is its size. Part II contains no less than 10,000 titles listed in alphabetical order (20 to 25 titles on each of 460 pages)—and this for a period of only a little more than two decades, 1918-41. Part I, which was issued in 1960, is said to be *twice* as big. Thus the complete "summary" must comprise some 30,000 proscribed books!

At first glance this figure seems staggering, but a little reflection on the punctiliousness of the Soviet censorship will suggest that it is no more than realistic. The total number of books published in the USSR from 1918 to 1941 on political and allied subjects—economics, history, literature, and the arts—must have numbered well over two hundred thousand. Considering the extent of the political purges in all fields of Soviet life during these years and the literary zeal of a Bukharin or Trotsky, it is not surprising that a significant proportion of the works published should have been proscribed for containing some shade of heretical thought.

Unfortunately, it is not possible to attempt more than a bare outline of the contents of the list. Let us begin with Part II since this is the part we know most about. Rather more than half the entries are works of individual authors, mainly memoirs and political tracts. In addition, there are collections of reports and documents as well as a number of works (*materialy*) by scholarly bodies such as Academies of Sciences or Institutes of Higher Learning in all parts of the country. There are also a few books of reference, including for instance six address and information handbooks (*adresno-spravochnye knigi*) for areas as diverse as Moscow, the Ukraine, and Transcaucasia in 1925-28.

Yet, despite its variety of content, Part II is obviously only a subsidiary compilation: it omits the main deviationist classics of the period. Trotsky, the archdemon, is represented by only three or four works from the middle 1920's including his essay "How the Revolution was Armed"; his collected writings, published in Moscow in 1925-27, are not listed. Zinoviev is down for only one book, *Socialism and the War*, on which he collaborated with Lenin in 1919, although the edition specifically mentioned in the Summary List appeared in Moscow in 1924; there is no mention of his 16-volume collected works published in 1924-26. Kamenev is similarly neglected, his name appearing only once, together with Stalin's, for "Against Trotskyism: (Leninism or Trotskyism)," published in the Crimea in 1925. Bukharin is not listed at all. The writer was not able to check up on whether the list included any of the earlier works of members of the "anti-party group," Beria, or individual literary and political scapegoats. Stalin's writings, understandably, were not included.

All this suggests that the really "hot" material churned out in these years went into Part I; indeed, the fact was confirmed to the writer by the source mentioned earlier. It is possible, too, that Part I was classified on a higher level of state secrecy and thus made less readily accessible than Part II. Otherwise there would seem to be no reason for the compilation of two alphabetical lists instead of one.

APART FROM its contents, the appearance of the "Summary List" in 1960-61 is in itself of considerable interest. It is primarily a reaffirmation of a long tradition of censorial proscription. A similar list came out in the mid-1930's; another was issued in 1949; and yet another was evidently in circulation in 1958. What we have here, therefore, is merely the latest in a series of proscription lists, each of which has no doubt included most of the titles from the preceding compilations, with additions and omissions in accordance with changes in the party line.

At the same time, the 1960-61 edition has some topical interest. An informant told the writer that while Part I merely reflected the continuing effort of the authorities to round up stray deviationist classics, Part II was to be used to call in all books showing the influence of the cult of the individual. There is probably a good deal of truth in the first part of his suggestion, but the second does not seem fully adequate. The chief objection is one of timing. The unmasking of Stalin started in earnest in February 1956 and therefore would hardly seem to explain the appearance of a proscription list nearly five and a half years later. Moreover, a large proportion of the titles listed in Part II first appeared in the early 1920's—many while Lenin was still alive—and could not be placed in the category of writings influenced by the Stalin cult.

Obviously, other more complex reasons must have entered into the compilation of Part II. For instance, the address books referred to earlier may have been found embarrassing because they provided information on Mensheviks or Trotskyites who disappeared and have never been rehabilitated. Other items included in Part II, such as *The Komsomol in the Village, a Collection of Documents on Fundamental Questions* (Moscow, 1925) or *The Soviets under Communism* (Moscow, 1925), to mention but two titles, may have been proscribed because they contained predictions on the growth of Soviet prosperity and the advent of the Communist society that either have since been invalidated or perhaps contradict the latest official pronouncements on these matters.

The success of the censors in purging the nation's bookshelves is not, however, assured. True, they can easily retrieve offending volumes from bookshops, state libraries, and other organizations, and can bury them in closed archives for the sole perusal of orthodox scholars. Indeed, very few of the older titles can now be left on

shelves accessible to the public. But unfortunately for them, the censors have no control over hundreds of thousands of tiny private libraries, and the books they want most to withdraw from circulation are precisely those which the owners are probably least willing to surrender. It is no secret that a black market in proscribed books exists and that it is quite beyond the realm of official censorship. This is where some, at least, of the 30,000 blacklisted titles may still be found. All the authorities can do is hope that copies of these books will eventually pass into the hands of secondhand book

dealers, who of course must know what to do with them. This is why extensive lists, such as the 1960-61 "Summary List," must be constantly compiled and distributed. They are at once a monument to the tenacity of free-thinking blackmarketeers and a manifestation of the scrupulous care which the Soviet authorities devote to obliterating embarrassing ideas, events, and names from the past.

\* \* \*

(To protect his sources, the author of the article above, a longtime student of Soviet affairs, prefers to remain anonymous.)

*Announcing*

A Special Issue of PROBLEMS OF COMMUNISM  
(March-April 1963)

*A Survey of Developments in the Communist World Since  
the Death of Stalin*

|                                                   |                           |
|---------------------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| A Discussion about Stalinism .....                | <i>Peter Wiles</i>        |
| The Role of the Leader .....                      | <i>Howard Swearer</i>     |
| Soviet Internal Politics .....                    | <i>Wolfgang Leonhard</i>  |
| Foreign Policy .....                              | <i>Helmut Sonnenfeldt</i> |
| International Communism .....                     | <i>Richard Lowenthal</i>  |
| Economic Developments .....                       | <i>Gregory Grossman</i>   |
| Ideological Convolutions and Transmutations ..... | <i>Erich Goldhagen</i>    |
| The Cultural Scene .....                          | <i>Ronald Hingley</i>     |
| The Past Reburied .....                           | <i>Leopold Labedz</i>     |
| Russia and China .....                            | <i>Mark Mancall</i>       |
| Eastern Europe .....                              | <i>Robert Bass</i>        |
| Books on Stalin .....                             | <i>Francis Randall</i>    |

Individual readers and organizations desiring to obtain additional copies of the March-April issue may contact the nearest office of the US Information Service, or—if in the United States—write to the Superintendent of Documents, Government Printing Office, Washington 25, DC. A list of USIS offices appears on the opposite page.

## Where to Obtain *Problems of Communism*

NOTE: In the United States, *Problems of Communism* is available on sale at the Superintendent of Documents, US Government Printing Office, Washington 25, D. C. Price per copy: \$.35; subscription price: \$1.50 a year; additional \$.50 for foreign mailing if orders are placed in the United States. Outside the United States, single copies or subscriptions may be obtained free of charge through requests addressed to the nearest office of the United States Information Service. Following are the locations of USIS offices:

### EUROPE

AUSTRIA—Vienna, Salzburg  
BELGIUM—Brussels  
DENMARK—Copenhagen  
FINLAND—Helsinki  
FRANCE—Paris, Bordeaux, Marseilles, Strasbourg, Tours  
GERMANY—Bonn, Berlin, Dusseldorf, Frankfurt, Hamburg, Munich, Stuttgart  
GREAT BRITAIN—London  
ICELAND—Reykjavik  
ITALY—Rome, Florence, Genoa, Milan, Naples, Palermo, Trieste, Turin  
NETHERLANDS—The Hague  
NORWAY—Oslo  
PORTUGAL—Lisbon  
SPAIN—Madrid, Barcelona, Seville  
(See note below on the Spanish-language edition published in Latin America)  
SWEDEN—Stockholm  
SWITZERLAND—Bern, Geneva  
YUGOSLAVIA—Belgrade, Zagreb

### NEAR EAST AND SOUTH ASIA

AFGHANISTAN—Kabul  
CEYLON—Colombo  
CYPRUS—Nicosia  
GREECE—Athens, Thessaloniki  
INDIA—New Delhi, Bombay, Calcutta, Madras  
IRAN—Tehran, Isfahan, Khorromshahr, Meshed, Tabriz  
IRAQ—Baghdad  
ISRAEL—Tel Aviv  
JORDAN—Amman  
LEBANON—Beirut  
NEPAL—Katmandu  
PAKISTAN—Karachi, Lahore, Dacca  
SAUDI ARABIA—Jidda  
SYRIAN ARAB REPUBLIC—Damascus  
TURKEY—Ankara, Istanbul, Izmir, Adana  
UNITED ARAB REPUBLIC—Cairo, Alexandria  
YEMEN—Taiz

### FAR EAST

AUSTRALIA—Canberra, Sydney, Melbourne  
BURMA—Rangoon, Mandalay, Moulmein  
CAMBODIA—Phnom Penh  
HONG KONG  
INDONESIA—Djakarta, Medan, Surabaya, Jogjakarta  
JAPAN—Tokyo, Fukuoka, Yokohama, Nagoya, Sapporo, Osaka  
KOREA—Seoul, Pusan, Taegu, Kwangju  
LAOS—Vientiane, Pakse, Luang Prabang, Savannakhet  
MALAYA—Kuala Lumpur, Penang

NEW ZEALAND—Wellington  
PHILIPPINES—Manila, Cebu  
SINGAPORE  
TAIWAN—Taipei, Kaohsiung, Taichung  
THAILAND—Bangkok, Chiangmai, Korat, Songkhla, Udorn, Ubol  
VIET NAM—Saigon, Hue, Can Tho, Dalat

### AFRICA

ALGERIA—Algiers  
BURUNDI—Usumbura  
CAMEROUN—Yaounde, Douala  
CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC—Bangui  
CHAD—Fort Lamy  
DAHOMEY—Cotonou  
ETHIOPIA—Addis Ababa, Asmara  
FEDERATION OF RHODESIA AND NYASALAND—Salisbury, Blantyre, Lusaka  
GABON—Libreville  
GHANA—Accra  
GUINEA—Conakry  
IVORY COAST—Abidjan  
KENYA—Nairobi  
LIBERIA—Monrovia  
LIBYA—Benghazi, Tripoli  
MALAGASY REPUBLIC—Tananarive  
MALI—Bamako  
MOROCCO—Rabat, Casablanca, Fez, Marrakech, Tangier  
NIGER—Niamey  
NIGERIA—Lagos, Enugu, Ibadan, Kaduna  
REPUBLIC OF CONGO—Brazzaville  
REPUBLIC OF THE CONGO—Leopoldville, Stanleyville, Bukaru  
REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA—Pretoria, Johannesburg, Capetown  
SENEGAL—Dakar  
SIERRA LEONE—Freetown  
SOMALI REPUBLIC—Mogadiscio  
SUDAN—Khartoum  
TANGANYIKA—Dar-es-Salaam  
TOGO—Lome  
TUNISIA—Tunis  
UGANDA—Kampala  
UPPER VOLTA—Ouagadougou  
ZANZIBAR—Zanzibar

### LATIN AMERICA

A list of USIS posts where the Spanish-language edition (*Problemas del Comunismo*) may be obtained is published in its current issue. The English edition is also available at these posts and in Brazil (Rio de Janeiro, Belo Horizonte, Brasilia, Curitiba, Porto Alegre, Recife, Salvador, Sao Paulo.)